

# The Problem “In” Kashmir, The Problem “Of” Kashmir



TRACING THE 60 YEAR OLD CONFLICT IN THE  
INDIAN SUBCONTINENT AND ITS IMPLICATIONS  
FOR REGIONAL AND GLOBAL SECURITY



SENIOR CAPSTONE PROJECT  
VASUNDHARA PRASAD '12  
CAPSTONE ADVISOR: DR. MINH A. LUONG  
INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS PROGRAM

# CONTENTS



- INTRODUCTION
- THE STATE OF JAMMU AND KASHMIR: ORIGINS OF THE CONFLICT
- ATTEMPTS AT MEDIATION: POLITICAL DEVELOPMENTS IN KASHMIR
- PATHWAYS TO PEACE: POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS
- CONCLUSION
- BIBLIOGRAPHY

# CONTENTS



- **INTRODUCTION**
- THE STATE OF JAMMU AND KASHMIR: ORIGINS OF THE CONFLICT
- ATTEMPTS AT MEDIATION: POLITICAL DEVELOPMENTS IN KASHMIR
- PATHWAYS TO PEACE: POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS
- CONCLUSION
- BIBLIOGRAPHY

# UNDERSTANDING KASHMIR



- The Kashmir conflict is a dispute between India and Pakistan over control of the region of Kashmir
- Each country lays claim to Kashmir due to nationalism and the controversial politics of the region
- Conflicting ideologies and the refusal of either party to compromise have stymied efforts to reach a solution

# KASHMIR: WHY SHOULD WE CARE?



- The conflict has been a great tragedy and a disaster in all respects:
  - a large death toll, human rights abuses, displacement of populations, a devastated economy, serious environmental damage, massive military buildup, and severe psychological distress.
- Kofi Anan in 2002: “In South Asia, the world has recently come closer than for many years past to a direct conflict between two nuclear weapon-capable states.”

# GEOGRAPHY



- Bordered by Afghanistan, India and China
- Most populated areas is the Valley of Kashmir, on the Indian side
- Currently divided into three regions: one controlled by India, one controlled by Pakistan, and a small area controlled by China



# DEMOGRAPHICS



- According to the 2011 Census, Kashmir has about 10 million residents
  - 7.5 million in Indian-controlled territory
  - 2.5 million in Pakistani controlled territory
- Three quarters of the population is Muslim, and the remaining one-quarter is predominantly Hindu.



# CONTENTS



- INTRODUCTION
- **THE STATE OF JAMMU AND KASHMIR:  
ORIGINS OF THE CONFLICT**
- ATTEMPTS AT MEDIATION: POLITICAL DEVELOPMENTS IN KASHMIR
- PATHWAYS TO PEACE: POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS
- CONCLUSION
- BIBLIOGRAPHY

# HISTORY



- A princely state under the rule of Great Britain
- 1947: India is partitioned into 2 nations, Pakistan and India
- The princely states allowed to join either dominion
- 26 October 1947: Fearing tribal warfare, the Maharaja (King) of Kashmir signed the Instrument of Accession
- 1948: UNSC passes Resolution 47, mandating a ceasefire along the Line of Control (LOC)

# KASHMIR, MORE THAN A TERRITORIAL DISPUTE?



- **Conflicting Nationalisms**
  - Pakistani Nationalism and the two-nation theory
    - ✦ Religious majority
    - ✦ How many times will India be partitioned due to the Muslim Question?
  - Indian Nationalism and secularism
    - ✦ Kashmir, inextricably tied up with India's secularism
    - ✦ Accession is legally indisputable
  - Ethnic nationalism and Kashmiriat
    - ✦ Kashmiris overwhelmingly favor independence
    - ✦ Problems: culturally dissimilar, economic unviable

# CONTENTS



- INTRODUCTION
- THE STATE OF JAMMU AND KASHMIR: ORIGINS OF THE CONFLICT
- **ATTEMPTS AT MEDIATION: POLITICAL DEVELOPMENTS IN KASHMIR**
- PATHWAYS TO PEACE: POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS
- CONCLUSION
- BIBLIOGRAPHY

# INITIAL TIMELINE



- 1952: The Muslim Constituent Assembly of J&K voted in favor of confirming accession to India
- 1963: 6 rounds of secret talks on “Kashmir and other related issues”
- 1971: Open war between India and Pakistan
  - Pakistan vs. East Pakistan; creation of Bangladesh
- 1972: Simla agreement is signed;
  - “resolved that the two countries put an end to the conflict and confrontation that have hitherto marred their relations and work for....a friendly and harmonious relationship and...durable peace on the subcontinent... and reconciliation [and] good neighborliness.”

# TURNING POINT: KARGIL CONFLICT



- 1999: Lahore Declaration is signed;
  - “intensify the composite and integrated dialogue process...on the basis of an agreed bilateral agenda.”
- 1999: Kargil War
  - LOC infiltration by Pakistani military units
  - Massive land and air campaign, first televised war for the two nations; immense loss of life on both sides

# DEVELOPMENTS IN THE NEW MILLENIUM



- 2001: Fidayeen attack on Indian Parliament
- 2005: Pakistani President Musharraf states that he would be willing to reconsider Pakistan's claim to Kashmir if India agreed to a self-government plan for the region
- 2006: Multiple train bombings in Mumbai, sponsored by the Lashkar-e-Toiba
- 2008: Mumbai attacks and seige
  - Lashkar-e-Toiba operates several training camps in Kashmir, and regularly carries out offensives against Indian forces in Jammu and Kashmir

# CONTENTS



- INTRODUCTION
- THE STATE OF JAMMU AND KASHMIR: ORIGINS OF THE CONFLICT
- ATTEMPTS AT MEDIATION: POLITICAL DEVELOPMENTS IN KASHMIR
- **PATHWAYS TO PEACE: POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS**
- CONCLUSION
- BIBLIOGRAPHY



# PATHWAYS TO PEACE: Bridging Perspectives



- Reconcile Popular Discourse on Kashmir
  - Undermines the peace process by perpetuating negative stereotypes and by preventing the exposure of the other side to civil society activists and common people
- Develop a new education curriculum
- Reform media
- Is Kashmir the only “core issue” between the two countries?

# PATHWAYS TO PEACE: Institutionalize Cooperation



- A sustained intergovernmental cooperation between the governments of the two nations is the essential basis of any Kashmir peace process
- The institutionalization process can be concretized in the form of a committee
  - Apart from acting as a watchdog, the scope of this kind of a body would also include ensuring that all deals and declarations made in the peace building process are followed-up on

## PATHWAYS TO PEACE: Economic Cooperation



- Commerce along the LoC could help in creating jobs and economic growth within communities and help establish stronger cross-border ties
- Partner with civil society groups and political parties
  - Promote tourism and job growth, which will alleviate poverty and illiteracy
- Open up to foreign bilateral aid donors
- Ambitious policy option: Create a special economic zone in all of Kashmir, with duty-free access to India and Pakistan

# PATHWAYS TO PEACE: Alleviate Human Rights



- Vast majority of India's army and paramilitary personnel deployed in the region and the war zones consists of men, mostly non-Muslim, and from outside the region itself
- What can be done?
  - Reduce the number of bunkers
  - Cease aggressive patrolling of the region
  - Redeploy units outside of population centers, either to bases outside of the region, or to placements as regular border security forces and nothing more
  - Set-up effective mechanisms for monitoring and enforcing compliance with human rights standards
- **Most Important:** Realize that large-scale abuses have occurred and that they are regretted; will help heal deep psychological wounds.

# PATHWAYS TO PEACE: Independent Kashmir?



- Bilateral vs. Trilateral dialogue?
- Plebiscite a possibility?
  - Polarizing effect
  - Dangerous formula for addressing sovereignty disputes
- “Unitary-sounding concept of self determination is inadequate when the self is deeply divided, even fractured.” Bose, Sumantra. *Contested Lands: Israel-Palestine, Kashmir, Bosnia, Cyprus, and Sri Lanka*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard UP, 2007. Print.

# PATHWAYS TO PEACE: Mitigate Terrorism

- How do Pakistan and India define terrorism in the context of Kashmir?
  - Pakistan: freedom struggle vs terrorism
  - India: proxy-war and low-intensity conflict



# PATHWAYS TO PEACE: Reform the Line of Control (LOC)



- The LOC is the military control line, which does not constitute as a legally recognized international boundary but is the de facto border
- Transform the character of the line into a “soft border” between the two self-governing entities of Indian Kashmir and Pakistani Kashmir
  - “Autonomy within autonomy”
  - Bridge of cooperation rather than a wall of antagonism
  - Free movement of people and goods
  - Inter-governmental cooperation in trade and commerce

# CONTENTS



- INTRODUCTION
- THE STATE OF JAMMU AND KASHMIR: ORIGINS OF THE CONFLICT
- ATTEMPTS AT MEDIATION: POLITICAL DEVELOPMENTS IN KASHMIR
- PATHWAYS TO PEACE: POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS
- **CONCLUSION**
- BIBLIOGRAPHY



# CONCLUSION



- With Operation Enduring Freedom continuing in Afghanistan, and the security and development related challenges in Pakistan, the Indo-Pak dialogue must resume, with regional security as a primary focus.
- Recurrent tensions over Kashmir will undercut any initiative to bring stability to South Asia as well as perpetuate the risk of a nuclear war.

# KASHMIR: PARADISE ON EARTH



# LEADERS SPEAK



*“In our search for a lasting solution to the Kashmir problem, both in its external and internal dimensions, we shall not traverse solely on the beaten track of the past. Mindsets will have to be altered and historical baggage jettisoned.”*

Atal Bihari Vajpayee, Prime Minister of India, January 2002

*“If we want to normalize relations between Pakistan and India and bring harmony to the region, the Kashmir dispute will have to be resolved peacefully through a dialogue, on the basis of the aspirations of the Kashmiri people. Solving the Kashmir issue is the joint responsibility of our two countries...Mr.Vajpayee...I take you up on this offer. Let us start talking in this spirit.”*

General Pervez Musharraf, President of Pakistan, January 2002

# CONTENTS



- INTRODUCTION
- THE STATE OF JAMMU AND KASHMIR: ORIGINS OF THE CONFLICT
- ATTEMPTS AT MEDIATION: POLITICAL DEVELOPMENTS IN KASHMIR
- PATHWAYS TO PEACE: POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS
- CONCLUSION
- **BIBLIOGRAPHY**

# BIBLIOGRAPHY



## **Books**

- Bose, Sumantra. *Contested Lands: Israel-Palestine, Kashmir, Bosnia, Cyprus, and Sri Lanka*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard UP, 2007. Print.
- Bose, Sumantra. *Kashmir: Roots of Conflict, Paths to Peace*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard UP, 2003. Print.
- Guha, Ramachandra. "Securing Kashmir." *India after Gandhi: the History of the World's Largest Democracy*. New York, NY: Harper Perennial, 2008. Print.
- Gupta, K. R. *India-Pakistan Relations with Special Reference to Kashmir*. New Delhi: Atlantic & Distributors, 2003. Print.
- Gupta, Sisir. *Kashmir: a Study in India-Pakistan Relations*. Bombay: Asia Pub. House, 1967. Print.
- Malik, Iffat. *Kashmir: Ethnic Conflict International Dispute*. Karachi: Oxford UP, 2002. Print.
- Varshney, Ashutosh. "Three Compromised Nationalisms: Why Kashmir Has Been a Problem." *Perspectives on Kashmir: the Roots of Conflict in South Asia*. Boulder: Westview, 1992. Print.

# BIBLIOGRAPHY (contd.)



## Articles

- Bajoria, Jayshree. "Realigning Pakistan's Security Forces." *Council On Foreign Relations*. Web. 14 Dec. 2011. <http://www.cfr.org/pakistan/realigning-pakistans-security-forces/p19660>
- Chenoy, Kamal. "Contending Nationalisms — Kashmir and the Prospects for Peace." *Harvard International Review*. Web. 16 Dec. 2011. <http://hir.harvard.edu/global-catastrophe/contending-nationalisms>
- Choudhry Ishtiaq A., and Rabia Akhtar. "India Pakistan Peace Process 2004-2008: A Case study of Kashmir". *Research Journal of International Studies* 13, 2010. 9 Dec 2011. 47. Print.
- Kamal Chenoy. "Contending Nationalisms: Kashmir and the Prospects for Peace". *Harvard International Review* (2006). 3. Web. 11 Dec 2010
- Markey, Daniel, C. Raja Mohan, Hasan-Askari Rizvi, Howard B. Schaffer, M. Farooq Kathwari. "How the Kashmir Dispute Affects Security in South Asia." *Council On Foreign Relations*. Web. 10 Dec. 2011. <http://www.cfr.org/terrorism/kashmir-dispute-affects-security-south-asia/p19805>
- Montiel, Cristina, and Mohd Noor. Noraini. "Political Violence and Peacebuilding in Jammu and Kashmir." *Peace Psychology in Asia*. Dordrecht: Springer, 2009. 65. Print.
- Schaffer, Teresita C. "Kashmir: The Economics Of Peace Building." *The Center for Strategic and International Studies*. Web. 16 Dec. 2011. <http://csis.org/files/media/csis/pubs/kashmirexecsummary.pdf>
- Yusuf, Moeed. "Promoting Cross-LoC Trade in Kashmir." *United States Institute of Peace*. Web. 16 Dec. 2011. <http://www.usip.org/resources/promoting-cross-loc-trade-in-kashmir>

# BIBLIOGRAPHY (contd.)



## Web

- "Peace Means Peace If Realities Are Not Ignored II." *GreaterKashmir.com from Srinagar Kashmir*. Web. 16 Dec. 2011.  
<http://www.greaterkashmir.com/news/2006/Feb/16/peace-means-peace-if-realities-are-not-ignored-ii-2.asp>
- "President General Pervez Musharaf's Address to the Nation, January 12, 2002." *Terrorism | South Asia Terrorism Portal*. Web. 16 Dec. 2011.  
<http://www.satp.org/satporgtp/countries/pakistan/document/papers/2002Jan12.htm>
- "Kashmir - Pakistan Mission to UN." *Pakistan Mission to The United Nations*. Web. 16 Dec. 2011.  
<http://www.pakun.org/kashmir/history.php>
- "Flashpoint Kashmir: Special Report." *BBC News | South Asia*. Web. 16 Dec. 2011.  
[http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/south\\_asia/355280.stm](http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/south_asia/355280.stm)
- Mehra, Uday S. "Nationalism's Mired Hopes." *Boston Review*. Web. 16 Dec. 2011.  
<http://www.bostonreview.net/BR28.1/mehta.html>
- Tikku, Alope. "Eight Ways to Peace: Govt Announces Kashmir Package." *Hindustan Times*. Web. 16 Dec. 2011.  
<http://www.hindustantimes.com/India-news/JAndK/Eight-ways-to-peace-Govt-announces-Kashmir-package/Article1-604521.aspx>